

Florian Kerschbaum and Michelle Mazurek

# Editors' Introduction

DOI 10.56553/popets-2022-0059

It is our great pleasure to introduce Issue 3 of Volume 2022 of the Proceedings on Privacy Enhancing Technologies (PoPETs). PoPETs is a journal that publishes articles accepted to the annual Privacy Enhancing Technologies Symposium (PETS). To contribute to the free availability of scientific publications, PoPETs is published under the open-access Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs license.

PoPETS/PETS uses a hybrid conference-journal model, one that has since been adopted by many other conferences in the field. In this model, articles are published throughout the year at regular intervals, and the papers for the year are then presented at an annual conference. Reviewers can request revisions of submitted articles, which may then be revised and resubmitted in the same year. PoPETs publishes four issues per year. By enabling resubmission across these issues, PoPETS provides a high-quality peer-review process that enables authors and reviewers to work together to produce and recognize significant scholarly contributions.

The PoPETS double-blind peer-review process is similar to other top-tier computer-security publications. The process includes initial review by the Editors-in-Chief for rules compliance and in-scope content, written reviews by multiple independent reviewers, author rebuttal, discussion among reviewers, and consensus decisions with disagreements resolved by the Editors-in-Chief. The output of the review process is a set of reviews, a meta-review summarizing the reviewers' opinions after discussion, and one of the following decisions: Accept, Accept with Minor Revisions, Major Revisions, Reject and Resubmit, and Reject.

Reviewing by the Editorial Board is performed in two rounds. In the first round, the Editors-in-Chief assign two reviewers from the Regular Editorial Board and a meta-reviewer from the Senior Editorial Board to all papers, and at the end of the round early decisions are made to reject certain papers that have two

reject scores (Reject or Reject and Resubmit) from the reviewers. The remaining papers receive additional reviews in the second round for a total of four reviews (in a few cases, submissions received fewer or more reviews). The meta-reviewer guides and summarizes the discussion into a meta-review and a decision recommendation to the Editors-in-Chief after the first or second round of reviewing.

Many articles had an external review drawn from a pool of junior experts nominated by the community<sup>1</sup>. Further external experts were invited to review certain articles. All reviews were sent to the authors of papers that proceeded to the second round of review, and those authors were invited to provide a written rebuttal to the reviews. After the rebuttal period there was a discussion among the reviewers, the meta-reviewer, other members of the Editorial Board, and the Editors-in-Chief to reach a consensus decision for each paper. The meta-reviewer then wrote a meta-review that summarized the discussion and the justification for the decision.

Articles submitted to this issue were reviewed by 149 members of the Regular Editorial Board, 26 members of the Senior Editorial Board and 66 external reviewers. The submitted articles, reviews, and discussion were available to all members of the Editorial Board who did not have a conflict of interest with the authors of the article. To identify conflicts of interest, the membership of the Editorial Board was published before submissions were opened, and authors were asked to indicate members with whom any of the authors had a conflict. In addition, Editorial Board members were asked to list the authors and institutions with which they have conflicts of interest. Finally, the Editors-in-Chief also checked for missed conflicts. Editorial Board members were welcome to submit articles, while the Editors-in-Chief were precluded from doing so.

There were 158 submissions to this issue of PoPETs. 23 of the 158 submissions had been invited during a previous issue to resubmit after major revision, and these were reassigned to the Editorial Board members that had reviewed the previous version. Since we started to assign meta-reviewers with this issue, a new meta-reviewer was assigned. Additionally, 15 articles that had been rejected from a previous issue were resubmitted to

---

**Florian Kerschbaum:** University of Waterloo, E-mail: [florian.kerschbaum@uwaterloo.ca](mailto:florian.kerschbaum@uwaterloo.ca)

**Michelle Mazurek:** University of Maryland, E-mail: [mmazurek@umd.edu](mailto:mmazurek@umd.edu)

---

<sup>1</sup> Nomination form: <https://bit.ly/2gxVDd8>

the journal, and they were reassigned to some of the same reviewers. For all these resubmissions, the authors provided a summary of changes made to the prior version that explained how review concerns had been addressed.

Of the 158 submissions, 13 papers were accepted, and 20 were conditionally accepted subject to minor revisions. For the latter, a reviewer was assigned as a shepherd to ensure that the important points from the meta-review were addressed. 34 articles were ultimately accepted and form the articles published in this issue including 1 which was postponed to this issue because of an unforeseen medical situation. These articles will be presented at PETS 2022.

The authors of 97 other articles were invited to resubmit to a future issue of PoPETs. For 37 of them, specific major revisions were requested, to be reviewed by the same reviewers when submitted to one of the following two PoPETs submission deadlines. The remaining 60 articles received a decision of Reject and Resubmit (20 of them during the first round of review), as reviewers identified needed revisions that were unlikely to be successfully addressed in a short time. 19 papers received a decision of Reject (13 of them during the first round), either due to serious deficiencies or to being out of scope for PoPETs. 8 submissions were rejected by the Editors-in-Chief without review by the Editorial Board for being out of scope, over the page limit, or non-anonymous. Finally, 1 submission was withdrawn by the authors during the review process.

For the 2022 volume, we continue an artifact-review procedure to collect, evaluate, and distribute any artifacts related to accepted papers (e.g. source code, datasets, machine-generated proofs, formal specifications, and build environments)<sup>2</sup>. Authors of accepted papers are encouraged (but not obliged) to submit their artifacts for review by an artifact-review committee. The committee performs some checks on artifact quality (e.g. documentation, licensing, and compilation); once approved, artifacts accompany the corresponding papers on the PETS website.

We thank the following people for making the first issue of PoPETs Volume 2022 possible:

#### General Chair for PETS 2022:

- Dali Kafaar, Macquarie University

#### Senior Program Committee / Editorial Board:

- Adam Aviv, George Washington University
- Lujo Bauer, Carnegie Mellon University
- Sherman S. M. Chow, Chinese University of Hong Kong
- Chris Clifton, Purdue University
- Álvaro Cárdenas, University of California Santa Cruz
- Claudia Diaz, KU Leuven
- David Evans, University of Virginia
- Rachel Greenstadt, New York University
- Jaap-Henk Hoepman, Radboud University
- Nick Hopper, University of Minnesota
- Aaron Johnson, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Apu Kapadia, Indiana University
- Stefan Katzenbeisser, University of Passau, Germany
- Ninghui Li, Purdue University
- Damon McCoy, New York University
- Catuscia Palamidessi, Inria
- Bart Preneel, KU Leuven
- Mike Rosulek, Oregon State University
- Micah Sherr, Georgetown University
- Paul Syverson, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Nina Taft, Google
- Carmela Troncoso, EPFL
- Blase Ur, University of Chicago
- Christo Wilson, Northeastern University
- Matthew Wright, Rochester Institute of Technology
- Melek Önen, EURECOM

#### Regular Program Committee / Editorial Board:

- Gunes Acar, Radboud University
- Yasemin Acar, Max Planck Institute for Security and Privacy
- Gergely Acs, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Shashank Agrawal, Western Digital Research
- Denise Anthony, University of Michigan
- Frederik Armknecht, Universität Mannheim
- Oshrat Ayalon, Max Planck Institute for Software Systems
- Erman Ayday, Bilkent University
- Saikrishna Badrinarayanan, Visa Research
- Borja Balle, DeepMind
- Diogo Barradas, University of Waterloo
- Muhammad Ahmad Bashir, Google
- Debabrota Basu, Inria
- Zinaida Benenson, University of Erlangen-Nuremberg

<sup>2</sup> <https://petsymposium.org/artifacts.php>

- Alastair Beresford, University of Cambridge
- Pascal Berrang, University of Birmingham
- Gergely Biczok, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Erik-Oliver Blass, Airbus
- Glencora Borradaile, Oregon State University
- Jonas Böhrer, SAP
- Rahul Chatterjee, University of Wisconsin
- Sze Yiu Chau, The Chinese University of Hong Kong
- David Choffnes, Northeastern University
- Omar Chowdhury, University of Iowa
- Camille Cobb, UIUC
- Jed Crandall, Arizona State University
- Robert Cunningham, Carnegie Mellon University/University of Pittsburgh
- Lucas Davi, Universität Duisburg Essen
- Martin Degeling, Ruhr-University Bochum
- Soteris Demetriou, Imperial College London
- Damien Desfontaines, Tumult Labs
- Rinku Dewri, University of Denver
- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Markus Dürmuth, Ruhr University Bochum
- Pardis Emami-Naeini, University of Washington
- Saba Eskandarian, UNC Chapel Hill
- Shehroze Farooqi, Palo Alto Networks
- Kassem Fawaz, University of Wisconsin - Madison
- Ellis Fenske, US Naval Academy
- Ferdinando Fioretto, Syracuse University
- Bryan Ford, EPFL
- Chaya Ganesh, Indian Institute of Science
- Simson Garfinkel, George Washington University
- Christina Garman, Purdue University
- Gennie Gebhart, EFF
- Badih Ghazi, Google
- Yossi Gilad, Hebrew University of Jerusalem
- Neil Gong, Duke University
- Adam Groce, Reed College
- Thomas Gross, Newcastle University
- Paul Grubbs, University of Michigan
- Cheng Guo, Clemson University / Google
- Emre Gursoy, Koç University
- Florian Hahn, University of Twente
- Rakibul Hasan, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Jamie Hayes, University College London
- Xi He, University of Waterloo
- Urs Hengartner, University of Waterloo
- Ryan Henry, University of Calgary
- Dominik Herrmann, University of Bamberg
- Julia Hesse, IBM Research - Zurich
- Yuan Hong, Illinois Institute of Technology
- Kévin Huguenin, University of Lausanne
- Mathias Humbert, armasuisse W+T
- Muhammad Ikram, Macquarie University
- Umar Iqbal, University of Washington
- Limin Jia, Carnegie Mellon University
- Kangsoo Jung, Inria
- Ghassan Karame, NEC Laboratories
- Marcel Keller, CSIRO's Data61
- Katharina Kohls, Radboud University
- Steve Kremer, INRIA
- Christiane Kuhn, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology
- Alptekin Küpçü, Koç University
- Peeter Laud, Cybernetica
- Arnaud Legout, Inria
- Ming Li, University of Texas at Arlington
- Heather Lipford, University of North Carolina at Charlotte
- Martin Lopatka, Unaffiliated
- Saeed Mahloujifar, Princeton
- Pasin Manurangsi, Google Research
- Piotr Mardziel, Truera
- Shrirang Mare, Western Washington University
- Athina Markopoulou, University of California, Irvine
- Abigail Marsh, Macalester College
- Atefeh Mashatan, Ryerson University
- Fabio Massacci, University of Trento/Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam
- Nick Mathewson, Tor Project
- Travis Mayberry, U.S. Naval Academy
- Peter Mayer, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology
- Susan McGregor, Data Science Institute, Columbia University
- Shagufta Mehnaz, Dartmouth College
- Meisam Mohammady, CSIRO Data 61-Concordia University
- Sonia Ben Mokhtar, CNRS
- Veelasha Moonsamy, Ruhr University Bochum
- Steven Murdoch, University College London
- Sashank Narain, University of Massachusetts Lowell
- Milad Nasr, UMass Amherst
- Chan Nam Ngo, University of Warsaw
- Rishab Nithyanand, University of Iowa
- Cristina Onete, University of Limoges / XLIM
- Simon Oya, University of Waterloo
- Panagiotis Papadopoulos, Telefonica Research
- Stefano Paraboschi, Università degli Studi di Bergamo
- Sikhar Patranabis, Visa Research
- Sai Teja Peddinti, Google

- Balazs Pejo, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Erica Portnoy, Electronic Frontier Foundation
- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University
- Apostolos Pyrgelis, EPFL
- Christina Pöpper, New York University Abu Dhabi
- Sazzadur Rahaman, University of Arizona
- Joel Reardon, University of Calgary
- Alfredo Rial, Nym Technologies
- Daniel Roche, U.S. Naval Academy
- Florentin Rochet, University of Edinburgh
- Thomas Roesler, Google
- Ryan Rogers, LinkedIn
- Stefanie Roos, TU Delft
- Andy Rupp, University of Luxembourg
- Paul Rösler, New York University
- Reihaneh Safavi-Naini, University of Calgary
- Nitesh Saxena, Texas A&M University
- Florian Schaub, University of Michigan
- Dominique Schröder, Friedrich-Alexander-Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg
- Wendy Seltzer, W3C
- Mahmood Sharif, Tel Aviv University and VMware
- Anastasia Shuba, Independent Researcher
- Mark Simkin, Aarhus University
- Claudio Soriente, NEC
- Yixin Sun, University Of Virginia
- Yuan Tian, University of Virginia
- Ni Trieu, Arizona State University
- Tobias Urban, Secunet Security Networks AG; Institute for Internet Security - if(is)
- Eugene Vasserman, Kansas State University
- Daniel Votipka, Tufts University
- Ding Wang, Nankai University
- Liang Wang, Princeton University
- Tao Wang, Simon Fraser University
- Tianhao Wang, Carnegie Mellon University
- Jason Xue, The University of Adelaide
- Yaxing Yao, University of Maryland, Baltimore County
- Attila Yavuz, University of South Florida
- Arkady Yerukhimovich, George Washington University
- Fan Zhang, Duke University
- Yang Zhang, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Yupeng Zhang, Texas A&M University
- Zhikun Zhang, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Yongjun Zhao, Nanyang Technological University

**Publications Chairs:**

- Weijia He, University of Chicago
- Anselme Tueno, SAP SE

**Artifact Chairs:**

- Cecylia Bocovich, The Tor Project
- Bailey Kacsmar, University of Waterloo

**Video Chair:**

- Benjamin Zhao, University of New South Wales / CSIRO Data61

**Publicity/Web Chairs:**

- Kat Hanna, The Tor Project
- Rebekah Overdorf, EPFL

**Infrastructure Chairs:**

- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Ian Goldberg, University of Waterloo

**Sponsorship Chairs:**

- Susan McGregor, Tow Center for Digital Journalism & Columbia Journalism School
- Steven Murdoch, University College London

**PET Award Chairs**

- Panagiotis (Panos) Papadimitratos, KTH
- Catuscia Palamidessi, INRIA

**We thank the following shepherds:**

- Oshrat Ayalon, Max Planck Institute for Software Systems
- Borja Balle, DeepMind
- Diogo Barradas, University of Waterloo
- Muhammad Ahmad Bashir, Google
- Martin Degeling, Ruhr-University Bochum
- Saba Eskandarian, UNC Chapel Hill
- Álvaro Feal, IMDEA Networks Institute / Universidad Carlos III de Madrid
- Mathias Humbert, armasuisse W+T
- Steve Kremer, INRIA
- Ming Li, University of Texas at Arlington
- Fabio Massacci, University of Trento/Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam

- Simon Oya, University of Waterloo
- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University
- Stefanie Roos, TU Delft
- Florian Schaub, University of Michigan
- Anastasia Shuba, Independent Researcher
- Daniel Votipka, Tufts University
- Liang Wang, Princeton University
- Yaxing Yao, University of Maryland, Baltimore County
- Fan Zhang, Duke University

**We thank the following external reviewers:**

- Lamya Abdullah, TU Darmstadt
- Archita Agarwal, Denison University
- Rasoul Akhavan Mahdavi, University of Waterloo
- Vafa Andalibi, Google
- Héber H. Arcolezi, nan
- Hassan Asghar, Macquarie University
- Enrico Bacis, Google
- Tamara Bonaci, t.bonaci@northeastern.edu
- Annalina Buckmann, Ruhr University Bochum
- Jeffrey Burdges, Web 3 Foundation
- Karoline Busse, University of Applied Administrative Sciences, Lower Saxony
- Domhnall Carlin, Queen's University Belfast
- Sergiu Carpov, Inpher
- Min Chen, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Mariano Di Martino, Hasselt University - Expertise Centre of Digital Media
- Nir Drucker, IBM Research - Haifa
- Kasra EdalatNejad, EPFL
- Christoph Egger, Independent
- Kaoutar Elkhiyaoui, IBM Research
- Navid Nasr Esfahani, nan
- Álvaro Feal, IMDEA Networks Institute / Universidad Carlos III de Madrid
- Romain Gay, IBM Research Zurich
- Christine Geeng, University of Washington
- Huijing Gong, nan
- Johanna Gunawan, Northeastern University Khoury College of Computer Sciences
- Lachlan J Gunn, nan
- Syed Mahbub Hafiz, University of California, Davis
- Weijia He, University of Chicago
- Hanan Hibshi, Carnegie Mellon University
- Alexander Hicks, University College London
- Jens Hiller, nan
- Murtuza Jadliwala, University of Texas at San Antonio
- Jinyuan Jia, Duke University
- Bailey Kacsmar, University of Waterloo
- Chelsea Komlo, University of Waterloo
- Joshua Kroll, Naval Postgraduate School
- Yi Liu, City University of Hong Kong
- Nathan Malkin, University of Maryland, College Park
- Rahat Masood, UNSW
- Kristopher Micinski, nan
- Ian Miers, nan
- Shujaat Mirza, New York University
- Victor Morel, Sustainable Computing Lab
- Sumit Mukherjee, Microsoft
- Benjamin Nguyen, LIFO / INSA Centre Val de Loire
- Nisha Panwar, nan
- Iñigo Querejeta Azurmendi, Input Output HK
- Kopo Marvin Ramokapane, University of Bristol
- Nathan Reitingner, UMD
- Vera Rimmer, DistriNet, KU Leuven
- Michael Rosenberg, University of Maryland
- Ahmed Salem, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Sajin Sasy, University of Waterloo
- Phillipp Schoppmann, Google
- Shawn Shan, nan
- Sandra Siby, EPFL
- Oleksii Starov, Palo Alto Networks
- Ruoxi Sun, University of Adelaide
- Oleksandr Tkachenko, TU Darmstadt
- Michael Toth, Inria
- Rahmadi Trimnada, University of California, Irvine
- Benjamin VanderSloot, Mozilla
- Ryan Wails, nan
- Miranda Wei, University of Washington
- Primal Wijesekera, nan
- Yixin Zou, University of Michigan

Sincerely,

Florian Kerschbaum and Michelle Mazurek

Co-Editors-in-Chief of PoPETs Volume 2022 and Program Co-Chairs of PETS 2022