# Editors' Introduction

Michelle Mazurek
University of Maryland
College Park, MD, USA
mmazurek@umd.edu

Micah Sherr
Georgetown University
Washington, D.C., USA
msherr@cs.georgetown.edu

It is our great pleasure to introduce Issue 4 of Volume 2023 of the Proceedings on Privacy Enhancing Technologies (PoPETs). PoPETs is a journal that publishes articles accepted to the annual Privacy Enhancing Technologies Symposium (PETS). To contribute to the free availability of scientific publications, PoPETs is published under the open-access Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs license.

PoPETs/PETS uses a hybrid conference-journal model, one that has since been adopted by many other conferences in the field. In this model, articles are published throughout the year at regular intervals, and the papers for the year are then presented at an annual conference. Reviewers can request revisions of submitted articles, which may then be revised and resubmitted in the next two issues. PoPETs publishes four issues per year. By enabling resubmission across issues, PoPETs provides a high-quality peer-review process that enables authors and reviewers to work together to produce and recognize significant scholarly contributions.

The PoPETs double-blind peer-review process is similar to other top-tier computer-security publications. The process includes initial review by the Editors-in-Chief for rules compliance and in-scope content, written reviews by multiple independent reviewers, author rebuttal, discussion among reviewers, and consensus decisions with disagreements resolved by the Editors-in-Chief. The output of the review process is a set of reviews, a meta-review summarizing the reviewers' opinions after discussion, and one of the following decisions: Accept, Accept with Minor Revisions, Major Revisions, Reject and Resubmit, and Reject.

Reviewing by the Editorial Board is performed in two rounds. In the first round, the Editors-in-Chief assign two reviewers from the Regular Editorial Board and a meta-reviewer from the Senior Editorial Board to all papers, and at the end of the round early decisions are made to reject certain papers that have two reject scores (Reject or Reject and Resubmit) from the reviewers. The remaining papers receive additional reviews in the second round for a total of four reviews (in a few cases, submissions received fewer or more reviews). The meta-reviewer guides and summarizes the discussion into a meta-review and a decision recommendation to the Editors-in-Chief after the first or second round of reviewing.

Many articles had an external review drawn from a pool of junior experts nominated by the community.[1] Further external experts were invited to review certain articles. All reviews were sent to the authors of papers that proceeded to the second round of review,

and those authors were invited to provide a written rebuttal to the reviews. After the rebuttal period there was a discussion among the reviewers, the meta-reviewer, other members of the Editorial Board, and the Editors-in-Chief to reach a consensus decision for each paper. The meta-reviewer then wrote a meta-review that summarized the discussion and the justification for the decision.

Articles submitted to this issue were reviewed by 144 members of the Regular Editorial Board, 21 members of the Senior Editorial Board and 65 external reviewers. The submitted articles, reviews, and discussion were available to all members of the Editorial Board who did not have a conflict of interest with the authors of the article. To identify conflicts of interest, the membership of the Editorial Board was published before submissions were opened, and authors were asked to indicate members with whom any of the authors had a conflict. In addition, Editorial Board members were asked to list the authors and institutions with which they have conflicts of interest. Finally, the Editors-in-Chief also checked for missed conflicts. Editorial Board members were welcome to submit articles, while the Editors-in-Chief were precluded from doing so.

There were 202 submissions to this issue of PoPETs. Twenty two of the 202 submissions had been invited during a previous issue to resubmit after major revision, and these were reassigned to the Editorial Board members that had reviewed the previous version, in most cases including the meta-reviewer (drawn from the Senior Editorial Board). Additionally, 22 articles that had been rejected from a previous issue were resubmitted to the journal, and they were reassigned to some of the same reviewers. For all these resubmissions, the authors provided a summary of changes made to the prior version that explained how review concerns had been addressed.

Of the 202 submissions, 14 papers were accepted, and another 19 were conditionally accepted subject to minor revisions. For the latter, a reviewer was assigned as a shepherd to ensure that the important points from the meta-review were addressed. The identity of the shepherd was kept secret from the authors, and communication between the authors and the shepherd was done (anonymously) through our article submission system. Thirty-three articles were ultimately accepted and form the articles published in this issue. These articles will be presented at PETS 2023.

The authors of 120 other articles were invited to resubmit to a future issue of PoPETs. For 36 of them, specific major revisions were requested, to be reviewed by the same reviewers when submitted to one of the following two PoPETs submission deadlines. The remaining 84 articles received a decision of Reject and Resubmit, as reviewers identified needed revisions that were unlikely to be successfully addressed in a short time. Twenty-eight papers received a decision of Reject, either due to serious deficiencies or to being out of scope for PoPETs. Seventeen submissions were rejected by the Editors-in-Chief without review by the Editorial Board for being

---

[1] The nomination form is available at https://forms.gle/yVQTfDesZgjGoZPbA.

out of scope, over the page limit, or non-anonymous. Finally, four submissions were withdrawn by the authors during the review process.

For the 2023 volume, we continue an artifact-review procedure to collect, evaluate, and distribute artifacts related to accepted papers (e.g. source code, datasets, machine-generated proofs, formal specifications, and build environments).[2] Authors of accepted papers are encouraged (but not obliged) to submit their artifacts for review by an artifact-review committee. The committee performs some checks on artifact quality (e.g. documentation, licensing, and compilation); once approved, artifacts accompany the corresponding papers on the PETS website.

We thank the following people for making the fourth issue of PoPETs Volume 2023 possible:

*General Chairs for PETS 2023:*

- Kévin Huguenin, University of Lausanne
- Carmela Troncoso, EPFL

*Senior Program Committee / Editorial Board:*

- Adam Aviv, George Washington University
- Lujo Bauer, Carnegie Mellon University
- Kevin Butler, University of Florida
- Sherman S. M. Chow, Chinese University of Hong Kong
- Nicolas Christin, Carnegie Mellon University
- Chris Clifton, Purdue University
- Serge Egelman, University of California, Berkeley / ICSI / AppCensus, Inc.
- Christina Garman, Purdue University
- Carrie Gates, Bank of America
- Ian Goldberg, University of Waterloo
- Nick Hopper, University of Minnesota
- Aaron Johnson, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Stefan Katzenbeisser, University of Passau, Germany
- Damon McCoy, New York University
- Bryan Parno, Carnegie Mellon University
- Florian Schaub, University of Michigan
- Paul Syverson, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Nina Taft, Google
- Blase Ur, University of Chicago
- Christo Wilson, Northeastern University
- Matthew Wright, Rochester Institute of Technology

*General Program Committee / Editorial Board:*

- Ruba Abu-Salma, King's College London
- Gunes Acar, Radboud University
- Omer Akgul, University of Maryland
- Mário Alvim, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais
- Abdelrahaman Aly, Cryptography Research Centre, Technology Innovation Institute (TII)
- Frederik Armknecht, Universität Mannheim
- Hassan Asghar, Macquarie University
- Saikrishna Badrinarayanan, LinkedIn
- Diogo Barradas, University of Waterloo
- Zinaida Benenson, University of Erlangen-Nuremberg
- Alastair Beresford, University of Cambridge

- Pascal Berrang, University of Birmingham
- Gergely Biczok, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Igor Bilogrevic, Google
- Eleanor Birrell, Pomona College
- Erik-Oliver Blass, Airbus
- Jonas Böhler, SAP SE
- Varun Chandrasekaran, Microsoft Research, University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign
- Melissa Chase, Microsoft Research
- Rahul Chatterjee, University of Wisconsin-Madison
- Sze Yiu Chau, Chinese University of Hong Kong
- Omar Chowdhury, Stony Brook University
- Shaanan Cohney, University of Melbourne
- Jean-François Couchot, FEMTO-ST Institute, Université de Franche-Comté
- Scott Coull, Google
- Jed Crandall, Arizona State University
- Robert Cunningham, University of Pittsburgh
- Anupam Das, North Carolina State University
- Martin Degeling, Stiftung Neue Verantwortung
- Soteris Demetriou, Imperial College London
- Damien Desfontaines, Tumult Labs
- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Nir Drucker, IBM Research - Israel
- Markus Dürmuth, Leibniz University Hannover
- Christoph Egger, IRIF, Université Paris Cité
- Tariq Elahi, University of Edinburgh
- Zeki Erkin, Delft University of Technology
- Saba Eskandarian, UNC Chapel Hill
- Álvaro Feal, Northeastern University
- Ellis Fenske, US Naval Academy
- Matt Fredrikson, Carnegie Mellon University
- Kevin Gallagher, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa
- Sébastien Gambs, Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)
- Paolo Gasti, New York Institute of Technology
- Gennie Gebhart, Electronic Frontier Foundation
- Badih Ghazi, Google Research
- Thomas Gross, Newcastle University, UK
- Cheng Guo, Clemson University / Google
- Emre Gürsoy, Koç University, Turkey
- Andreas Haeberlen, University of Pennsylvania
- Florian Hahn, University of Twente
- Rakibul Hasan, Arizona State University
- Weijia He, Dartmouth College
- Urs Hengartner, University of Waterloo
- Dominik Herrmann, University of Bamberg, Germany
- Jens Hiller, Google
- Thang Hoang, Virginia Tech
- Yuan Hong, University of Connecticut
- Amir Houmansadr, UMass Amherst
- Roberto Hoyle, Oberlin College
- Murtuza Jadliwala, The University of Texas at San Antonio
- Jinyuan Jia, UIUC
- Limin Jia, Carnegie Mellon University
- Marc Juarez, University of Edinburgh
- Bailey Kacsmar, University of Waterloo

---

[2]https://petsymposium.org/artifacts.php

- Ghassan Karame, Ruhr-University Bochum
- Marcel Keller, CSIRO's Data61
- Steve Kremer, Inria Nancy
- Christiane Kuhn, NEC Laboratories Europe
- Piyush Kumar Sharma, KU Leuven
- Peeter Laud, Cybernetica AS
- Arnaud Legout, Inria
- Brian Levine, University of Massachusetts Amherst
- Ming Li, The University of Texas at Arlington
- Saeed Mahloujifar, FAIR, Meta AI
- Mohammad Malekzadeh, Nokia Bell Labs
- Pasin Manurangsi, Google Research
- Piotr Mardziel, Independent
- Shrirang Mare, Western Washington University
- Rahat Masood, The University of New South Wales (UNSW)
- Fabio Massacci, University of Trento, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam
- Peter Mayer, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology
- Shagufta Mehnaz, The Pennsylvania State University
- Ian Miers, University of Maryland
- Veelasha Moonsamy, Ruhr University Bochum
- Victor Morel, Chalmers University of Technology
- Pedro Moreno-Sanchez, IMDEA Software Institute
- Sumit Mukherjee, insitro
- Steven Murdoch, University College London
- Adwait Nadkarni, William & Mary
- Sashank Narain, University of Massachusetts Lowell
- Milad Nasr, Google Brain
- Chan Nam Ngo, Kyber Network
- Benjamin Nguyen, INSA Centre Val de Loire
- Shirin Nilizadeh, The University of Texas at Arlington
- Rebekah Overdorf, University of Lausanne
- Simon Oya, University of Waterloo
- Nisha Panwar, Assistant Professor School of Computer and Cyber Sciences Augusta University
- Stefano Paraboschi, Università degli Studi di Bergamo
- Paul Pearce, Georgia Tech
- Sai Teja Peddinti, Google
- Balazs Pejo, CrySyS Lab, BME
- Andreas Peter, University of Oldenburg
- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University, Sweden
- Apostolos Pyrgelis, EPFL
- Christina Pöpper, New York University Abu Dhabi
- Ananth Raghunathan, Meta Inc
- Sazzadur Rahaman, University of Arizona
- Joel Reardon, University of Calgary and AppCensus, Inc.
- Alfredo Rial, Nym Technologies
- Vera Rimmer, imec-DistriNet, KU Leuven
- Daniel Roche, U.S. Naval Academy
- Stefanie Roos, TU Delft
- Paul Rösler, New York University
- Andy Rupp, University of Luxembourg and KASTEL SRL
- Reihaneh Safavi-Naini, University of Calgary
- Wendy Seltzer, W3C/MIT
- Shawn Shan, University of Chicago
- Mahmood Sharif, Tel Aviv University
- Sandra Siby, EPFL

- Georgios Smaragdakis, TU Delft
- David Marco Sommer, Zuehlke
- Claudio Soriente, NEC Laboratories Europe
- Guillermo Suarez-Tangil, IMDEA Networks Institute
- Jose Such, King's College London
- Ruoxi Sun, The University of Adelaide & CSIRO's Data61
- Iraklis Symeonidis, RISE - Research Institutes of Sweden
- Daniel Takabi, Georgia State University
- Ni Trieu, Arizona State University
- Anselme Tueno, SAP
- Nirvan Tyagi, Cornell University
- Benjamin Ujcich, Georgetown University
- Tobias Urban, Institute for Internet Security & secunet Security Networks AG
- Tavish Vaidya, Google
- Eugene Vasserman, Kansas State University
- Ryan Wails, Georgetown University, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Ding Wang, Nankai University
- Liang Wang, Princeton University
- Shuai Wang, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology
- Tianhao Wang, University of Virginia
- Attila Yavuz, University of South Florida
- Zhikun Zhang, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Yongjun Zhao, ByteDance
- Yixin Zou, University of Michigan / Max Planck Institute for Security and Privacy

*Publications Chairs:*
- Weijia He, University of Chicago
- Dhruv Kuchhal, Georgia Tech

*Artifact Chairs:*
- Bailey Kacsmar, University of Waterloo
- Pasin Manurangsi, Google Research

*Local Arrangements Chair.*
- Mathias Humbert, University of Lausanne

*Publicity/Web Chairs:*
- Kat Hanna, The Tor Project
- Mathilde Raynal, EPFL

*Infrastructure Chairs:*
- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Ian Goldberg, University of Waterloo

*Sponsorship Chairs:*
- Susan McGregor, Tow Center for Digital Journalism & Columbia Journalism School
- Steven Murdoch, University College London

*Stipend Chairs:*
- Tariq Elahi, University of Edinburgh
- Murtuza Jadliwala, University of Texas at San Antonio
- Susan E McGregor, Columbia University
- Veelasha Moonsamy, Ruhr University Bochum

- Awais Rashid, University of Bristol

*PET Award Chairs.*

- Emiliano De Cristofaro, University College London
- Dali Kaafar, Macquarie University Sydney Australia

*We thank the anonymous shepherds for their hard work.*

*We thank the following external reviewers:*

- Mohammed Abuhamad, Loyola University Chicago
- Erman Ayday, Case Western Reserve University
- Laasya Bangalore, Georgetown Univeristy
- Sarah Bargal, Georgetown University
- Johes Bater, Tufts University
- Sruti Bhagavatula, Northwestern University
- Arthur Borem, University of Chicago
- Alessandro Brighente, University of Padova
- Jurlind Budurushi, Qatar University
- Duc Bui, Snap Inc.
- Darion Cassel, Carnegie Mellon University
- Kovila Coopamootoo, King's College London
- Rasmus Dahlberg, Karlstad University
- Debajyoti Das, KU Leuven
- Sven Dietrich, City University of New York
- Kaoutar Elkhiyaoui, IBM Research
- Yuanyuan Feng, University of Vermont
- Simone Ferlin-Reiter, Red Hat, Karlstad university
- Sepideh Ghanavati, University of Maine
- Lachlan Gunn, Aalto University
- Héber H. Arcolezi, Inria and École Polytechnique (IPP)
- Lucjan Hanzlik, CISPA – Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Hanan Hibshi, Carnegie Mellon University
- David Ke Hong, Meta Platforms Inc.
- Máté Horváth, University of Wuppertal
- Thomas Humphries, University of Waterloo
- Thomas Hupperich, University of Münster, Germany
- Shalabh Jain, Research and Technology Center, Robert Bosch LLC
- Pritish Kamath, Google Research
- Ferhat Karakoç, Ericsson
- Nadim Kobeissi, Nym Technologies SA / Symbolic Software
- Antti Koskela, Nokia Bell Labs
- Joshua A. Kroll, Naval Postgraduate School
- Tianshi Li, CMU
- Karola Marky, Ruhr-University Bochum
- Miti Mazmudar, University of Waterloo
- Federico Mazzone, University of Twente
- Jon McCune, Google
- Peihan Miao, Brown University
- Nicholas Micallef, Swansea University
- Antonis Michalas, Tampere University
- Hazel Murray, Munster Technological University
- Navid NASR ESFAHANI, Memorial University
- Boel Nelson, University of Copenhagen
- Lennart Oldenburg, imec-COSIC KU Leuven
- Kentrell Owens, University of Washington

- Andriy Panchenko, Brandenburg University of Technology (BTU)
- Tran Phuong, OLD DOMINION UNIVERSITY
- Amogh Pradeep, nan
- Rahul Rachuri, Aarhus University
- Nathan Reitinger, University of Maryland
- Richard Roberts, University of Maryland
- Michael Rosenberg, University of Maryland
- Edo Roth, Google
- Siamak Shahandashti, University of York
- Faysal Hossain Shezan, University of Virginia
- Tjerand Silde, Norwegian University of Science and Technology
- Cristian-Alexandru Staicu, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Santiago Torres Arias, Purdue University
- Rahmadi Trimananda, University of California, Irvine
- Lindsey Tulloch, University of Waterloo
- Dmitrii Usynin, Imperial College London and Technical University of Munich
- Lun Wang, Google
- Aiping Xiong, Pennsylvania State University
- Zhikun Zhang, Stanford University

Sincerely,

Michelle Mazurek and Micah Sherr

Co-Editors-in-Chief of PoPETs Volume 2023
Program Co-Chairs of PETS 2023